Appendix B1

Scoping Phase – Key Outcomes

B.1 OUTCOME OF SCOPING ENGAGEMENT

B.1.1 STAKEHOLDERS ENGAGED

The ESIA team conducted the Scoping round of engagement in March 2014. The objective of engagement was to:

- meet key stakeholders and introduce them to the proposed Project and ESIA;

- generate feedback on the Draft Scoping Report, including the scope, approach and key issues to be investigated further for the ESIA; and

- consult key stakeholders on the next steps in the ESIA process.

This was undertaken through a series of face-to-face meetings and workshops with key stakeholders at the federal, regional and local levels. An outline of stakeholders that were engaged at each level is in *Table B.1* below.

Table B.1   *Stakeholder Consultation Meetings*

Organisation	Date	Location
Federal Government		
Ministry of Environmental Protection and Forestry	3 March 2014	Addis Ababa
Ministry of Mines	3 March 2014	Addis Ababa
Ministry of Culture & Tourism	3 and 4 March 2014	Addis Ababa
Ministry of Water, Irrigation and Energy	3 March 2014	Addis Ababa
Ministry of Federal Affairs	3 March 2014	Addis Ababa
In addition the Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Women, Children and Youth Affairs, Ministry of Urban Development, Housing and Construction were contacted and provided with a copy of the Draft Scoping Report for comment.		
Regional Government		
Bureau of Environmental Protection, Rural Land Use and Administration	6 and 7 March 2014	Semera
Bureau of Finance & Economic Development	6 and 7 March 2014	Semera
Bureau of Water Resources	6 and 7 March 2014	Semera
Bureau of Culture & Tourism	6 and 7 March 2014	Semera
Bureau of Mines and Energy	6 and 7 March 2014	Semera
Local Government		
Berahale Woreda Council and offices	13 March 2014	Berahale Town
Dallol Woreda Administration	13 March 2014	Adiquwa
Dallol Bureau of Justice and Security	13 March 2014	Adiquwa
Dallol Bureau for Agriculture and Pastoralism	13 March 2014	Adiquwa
Dallol Bureau of Economic Development	13 March 2014	Adiquwa
Dallol Bureau of Health	13 March 2014	Adiquwa
Community Associations		

Organisation	Date	Location
Berahale Salt Selling & Buying Association	12 March 2014	Berahale Town
Women's Palm Association	12 March 2014	Berahale Town
Tourism Operators & Experts		
Medir Tours	4 March 2014	Addis Ababa
Marinata Tours	4 March 2014	Addis Ababa
Ethioder Plc	4 March 2014	Addis Ababa
Off Road Ethiopia	4 March 2014	Addis Ababa
Federal NGOs		
Forum for the Environment	4 March 2014	Addis Ababa
Research and Academic Institutions		
Authority for Research and Conservation of Cultural Heritage	4 March 2014	Addis Ababa
Addis Ababa University (departments of Biology, Archaeology, Geology)	4 March 2014	Addis Ababa
Semera University	6 and 7 March 2014	Semera
Settlements/Communities*		
Ambule	10 March 2014	Ambule
Musley	10 March 2014	Musley
Beheiti (Asabuya)	10 March 2014	Asabuya
Bada Ermile	11 March 2014	Central Bada
Bada Admeruq	11 March 2014	Central Bada
Asabolo	10 March 2014	Asabolo
Hamad Ela	12 March 2014	Hamad Ela
Mororo	13 March 2014	Mororo
Morror	13 March 2014	Morror
Alai lai	13 March 2014	Alai lai

* Community consultations involved engagement with the clan leader, local elders and religious leaders as well as selected women and youth as identified by the local elders and clan leader.

C.1.2 ISSUES AND COMMENTS

Stakeholders engaged raised a series of questions, comments and concerns. A summary of the key issues identified through the compilation of the meeting records (*Appendix B2*) has been generated and is provided in *Table B.2* and *Table B.3* below. *Table B.2* focuses on ESIA related comments and issues, while *Table B.3* looks at more general project related issues.

Table B.2   *ESIA Related Issues*

Issue Category	Issue	Details on the Issue	Stakeholder Raising Issue
Anticipated Impacts	Water resources	• Stakeholders at all three levels identified significant concerns around the perceived scarcity of water in the local area, and potential impacts for abstraction of water for mining to result in declines in water resources available for the local population and animals. • The abstraction of groundwater could result in a decline the water recharging the pools located on Mount Dallol (which are key tourist attractions). • The potential decline in groundwater levels caused by abstraction of water by Yara could result in the decline in important vegetation in the area, including plants that livestock and camels feed on, as well as doum palms that are a key source of income for local women, and hold cultural value for the Afar people.	• All stakeholder groups
	Tourism	• The overall development of the area will deter tourists from visiting the area, in particular if the area becomes industrialised. • Concerns were raised over the proximity of Yara's license area, as well as other developments in the area to Mount Dallol. • The increases in traffic that have already been reported in the local area from mining companies is reported to be causing pollution (dust) and disturbance to tourists that stay in Hamad Ela. • The potential decline in water resources will have secondary impacts on surface water bodies located on and around Mount Dallol, and that form key tourist attractions. • The development of infrastructure (mainly the road) by the federal government for mining companies in the Danakil Depression will lead to increases in-migration, resulting in disturbance and pollution of important landmarks and tourist attractions.	• Federal government • Regional government • Local government • Tourism operators • Local communities
	In-migration	• The development of infrastructure in the local area, as well as the presence of mining companies in the area is likely to result in in-migration. Concerns were raised over the secondary impacts such as pressure on existing infrastructure, localised inflation and competition over land and resources. • In-migration and resulting changes in the local health profile (communicable diseases including sexually transmitted diseases) is a	• Federal government • Regional government • Local government

Issue Category	Issue	Details on the Issue	Stakeholder Raising Issue
		key concern. A lot of case studies from the extractives sector elsewhere in Ethiopia were referenced where increases in the communicable disease have not been managed adequately.	
	Traffic	• Increases in traffic have been noted in the local area, much of which is attributed to mining companies including Yara. The increase in traffic is reported to have led to increased pollution and disturbance to local residents and tourists. • Concerns over the increases in traffic will lead to disturbance to important areas, such as those used for salt collection and where important vegetation is found.	• Tourism operators • Federal government • Local communities
	Ecology	• The Danakil is identified to be an area that has not been studied in detail; therefore there are concerns that species (flora and fauna) exist that are specific to the Danakil and may be threatened by project activities. • The potential decline in water resources due to groundwater abstraction by Yara may threaten local biodiversity. • Further studies should be conducted with regards to the ecological nature of the area, taking into account potential seasonal variations in the local ecology.	• Academic and research institutions • Regional government • Local government
	Health	• Potential impacts on the health and safety of people recruited by Yara, in particular local people who may not be accustomed to working for a mining company. • Changes to the community health profile (increases in communicable and sexually transmitted diseases) due to potential in-migration of people, as well as the introduction of a workforce by Yara. • The potential decline in water resources due to mining activities may have consequences on community health, as they access water through hand dug wells. In addition there maybe secondary impacts to key resources (salt, palms) that are used to generate income.	• Federal government • Regional government • Local government • Local communities • Community associations
	Military	• There is reported to be an unnecessary use of the military in the local area, as well as recruitment of militia. • Reports of the military being used to threaten stakeholders (in particular local communities).	• Regional government • Local communities
	Access and use of land (and natural resources)	• Land use and access is still administered through a common property regime, although government policies contradict this. • People in the local area are mobile, and are accustomed to accessing land and resources in a seasonal nature. The movement of people and	• Regional government • Local government • Academic and research institutes

Issue Category	Issue	Details on the Issue	Stakeholder Raising Issue
		pastoralist activities need to be considered by Yara, as well as in the ESIA process. • Pastoralists were identified as a potentially vulnerable group, and measures need to be developed to ensure that pastoralists are able to adapt and benefit to any changes that the proposed Project brings.	• Local communities
	Archaeology and cultural heritage	• There are numerous locations across the local area that are used for burials. • In addition there are important cultural landmarks such as Mount Dallol and Ashe Ale that need to be protected from potential disturbance and damage.	• Local communities • Regional government • Local government • Academic and research institutes
	Gender	• The impacts to women need to be considered in the ESIA process. • Women are a potentially vulnerable group due to their position in Afar society. In addition they chiefly rely on the collection of palms to generate an income, thus protection of this resource is key. • Women should look to benefit from the proposed Project through community development activities and employment opportunities.	• Regional government • Local government • Community associations
Process Related	Engagement	• Further engagement should be conducted with stakeholders, in particular with local stakeholders to ensure that they are aware of the proposed Project, its stages and activities.	• Regional government • Local government • Local communities
	Methodologies for specialist studies	• Request for detailed methodologies around specialists' studies and their results should be presented in the ESIA report, in particular the hydrological studies.	• Federal government • Regional government • Academic and research institutes

In addition to a set of ESIA related comments, a set of Project related issues, concerns and recommendations were raised by stakeholders. These are summarised below in *Table B.3*.

Table B.3   *Project Related Issues*

Issue Category	Issue	Further Detail on the Issue	Stakeholder Raising Issue
Communication and engagement	Consistency in communication	• Inconsistencies in communication with stakeholders were identified at the local level in particular. This predominantly revolved around communication regarding labour and recruitment opportunities.	• Regional government • Local government • Local communities
	The proposed Project	There are several misconceptions around the proposed Project including: • ownership of the project; • stage of the project; • location of the project.	• Regional government • Local government • Local communities
Existing impacts	Labour and recruitment	Numerous concerns were raised with regards to labour and recruitment practices (actual or perceived) including: • inconsistency in the way in which contracts are terminated, including communication around this. • preferential recruitment and treatment of non-Afar employees. • inequalities in the positions and salaries offered to Afari employees.	• Regional government • Local government • Local communities
	Water	• Concerns were raised that the presence of mining companies in the area over the past three years has led to a decline in water resources.	• Local communities
	Traffic	Complaints raised that Yara (and other projects working in the area) has led to an increase in traffic in the local area, with resulting impacts to: • air pollution (dust emissions) • damage to local vegetation • potential accidents with communities and livestock • disturbance to tourists.	• Local government • Local communities • Tourism operators
Anticipated benefits	Employment	• There is considerable expectation for local stakeholders to benefit from employment opportunities arising from the proposed Project. • The importance of local communities benefiting from the proposed Project was highlighted at all levels.	• Regional government • Local government • Local communities
	Community development initiatives	Expectation that in addition to employment opportunities, stakeholders will benefit from community development initiatives. It was acknowledged that local stakeholders are not likely to largely benefit from employment opportunities, in particular skilled positions. Therefore it is expected that local stakeholders should benefit from proposed community development initiatives including: • access to potable water; • support and improvement to health and educational facilities; • capacity building and skills training.	• Federal government • Regional government • Local government • Local communities